

Letter to the Editor

*H Rahmati-holasoo, HA Ebrahimzadeh Mousavi

Department of Aquatic Animal Health, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

Dear Editor-in-Chief

In Iranian Journal of Parasitology Vol.5, No.2, 2011, a paper entitled “The First Record of Argulus foliaceus (Crustacea: Branchiura) Infestation on Lionhead goldfish (Carassius auratus) in Iran” was published. There are some points that should be taken into consideration. In the paper it has been claimed that Argulus foliaceus in gold fish is the first report in Iran. However, this parasite is very common in cyprinid including gold fish (Carassius auratus) (1) and reviewing the literature it is clear that it is not the first report and such a report cannot be true. Ebrahimzadeh Mousavi (2003) in a study on 8 species of ornamental fishes conducted from 1997 to 2001 had reported infestation of goldfish (Carassius auratus) with A. foliaceus (2). In a similar study on parasitic infestation of aquarium fishes of Tehran Province conducted in 2004 and published in 2006, infestation of two cases of goldfish with this parasite were reported (3). This indicates that bibliography is not perfect in the published paper. On the other hand, review of literature in the paper is conducted regardless of domestic reports about Iranian cyprinids. It goes without saying that in such studies domestic and local reports are of crucial importance. In the paper only one reference from a book has been cited. There is no journal citation in the paper about domestic studies on the case. In the paper only one overseas reference is cited that may mislead general readers as there is no local report. It should be noted that because of variation in species when a paper is written about parasitic infestation of fishes, local reports must be taken into consideration. Reviewing the literature one could easily find out that A. foliaceus is a common parasite in Iran. For example isolation of Argulus sp. from goldfish in Tabriz was reported in 2009 (4). Regarding parasitic infestation of aquarium fishes of Isfahan, infestation of fish with A. foliaceus was reported (5). Infestations of other cyprinids with Argulus were reported for many times in Iran. For example A. foliaceus was reported on the skin of common carp in Anzali Lagoon in Caspian Basin and on some cyprinid fish species in Zarivar Lake and also in various other parts of Iran (6-9).

Another point about the paper is that scientific citation of the parasite in the text and

*Corresponding author: E-mail: rahmatih@ut.ac.ir. Tel: +982161117095
Letter to the Editor

The legend of figures was written in two forms (Argulus foliaceus and Argulus foliacesus). The quality of the figures is not sufficient for readers and especially Figures 2 and 3 are not completely matched together. In the photomicrograph the Argulus has got a dom-like prominence in the anterior part. However in the drawing the prominence is not seen and it is designed sharply. In general, the paper lacks local reference citation and homogeneous citation of the scientific name throughout the text and figure legends.

In response to answer of the author, for reporting a disease in fish as a first report, it should be mentioned that scientific names should be noticed. Because a scientific name is unique but common name is different in various counties and depends on shape and color of body and form of scales.

References


Reply by Noaman et al.

Dear Editor-in-Chief

Iranian J Parasitol

Many thanks for constructive aforementioned comments, which have been made by Dr. Rahmati-holasoo and Ebrahimzadeh Mousavi about our recently published article.

In the introduction and discussion of our paper, we stated that the Argulus sp. is reported from different fish species worldwide (1-6) and Iran (7) and about 15 spp. are found on freshwater fishes (8, 9). As pointed out in this issue, the aim of study was determination of causes of death in lionhead goldfish. This article has not been emphasized on first isolation of Argulus foliaceus but the emphasis is on Lionhead goldfish. On the other hand, there is no mention of Lionhead goldfish in the domestic papers. Finally, adding more appropriate local citations from reliable sources can help to richness of article.
Respectfully
Noaman V
Tel: +983117885460, Fax: 03117757022,
Email: vnoaman@gmail.com

References